



Nathaniel Lichfield and Partners

Planning Design Economics

Barry Waterfront

Retail Assessment

14th August 2009

Nathaniel Lichfield & Partners Ltd

1st Floor, Westville House
Fitzalan Court
Cardiff CF24 0EL

T 029 2043 5880
F 029 2049 4081

cardiff@nlplanning.com
www.nlplanning.com

Offices also in
London
Manchester
Newcastle upon Tyne

Contents

1.0	Introduction	1
2.0	Site and Proposed Development	3
3.0	Relevant Planning Policy	5
	National Policy	5
	Local Planning Policy	5
	Key Policy Considerations	5
4.0	Existing Retail Provision & Shopping Patterns	7
	The Vale of Glamorgan Retail Study (May 2009)	7
	Martin Tonks Town & District Retail Centre Appraisal (2008)	9
	Retail Hierarchy	9
	Existing Convenience Shopping Provision	10
	Existing Comparison Shopping Provision	11
	Retail Allocations, Commitments and Recent Developments	12
	Retail Proposals	14
	Existing Shopping Patterns	14
	Changes in Shopping Provision	17
5.0	Barry Town Centre	18
	Diversity of Town Centre Uses	18
	Retailer Representation	19
	Shopping Rents and Yields	20
	Proportion of Vacant Street Level Property	20
	Conclusion	21
6.0	Retail Need	22
	Quantitative Convenience Retail Capacity	22
	Quantitative Comparison Retail Capacity	24
	Qualitative Retail Need	26
7.0	Scale	28
8.0	Sequential Approach	30
	Methodology	30
	Area of Search	30
	Flexibility	31
	Identification of Sites	31
	Assessment of Sites	32
	Sequential Conclusions	33

9.0	Town Centre Impacts	35
	Convenience Trade Diversion	35
	Comparison Trade Draw	38
	Impact Conclusions	42

10.0	Conclusions	43
-------------	--------------------	-----------

Appendix 1: Catchment Area & Existing Foodstore Provision Plan and Retail Hierarchy Plan

Appendix 2: Household Survey Results

Appendix 3: Barry Goad Plan

Appendix 4: Convenience Retail Capacity Analysis

Appendix 5: Comparison Retail Capacity Analysis

Appendix 6: Sequential Site Assessment

Appendix 7: Convenience Impact Assessment

Appendix 8: Comparison Impact Assessment

Tables

Table 1	Catchment Area Zones	15
Table 2	Mix of Uses in Barry Town Centre	19
Table 3	Commercial Yields in South Wales	20
Table 4	Convenience Capacity Summary	24
Table 5	Comparison Expenditure by Zone	25
Table 6	Scale of Existing Foodstores in Local Area	28
Table 7	Trade Pattern by Zone at 2012	36
Table 8	Convenience Impact Summary Table	38
Table 9	Summary of Comparison Market Shares	40
Table 10	Proposed Comparison Trade Draw Summary	40
Table 11	Comparison Floorspace Impact Summary	41

1.0 Introduction

1.1 This Retail Assessment (RA) has been prepared by Nathaniel Lichfield and Partners (NLP) on behalf of Persimmon Homes, Barratt Homes and Taylor Wimpey (“The Consortium”). It provides information on retail planning issues to assist the Council in its consideration of the retail element of the proposed redevelopment of Barry Waterfront.

1.2 The RA is one of a number of reports and statements submitted to accompany the outline planning application and should be read in conjunction with these documents which are listed below:

- Planning Statement;
- Design and Access Statement;
- Sustainability and Energy Statement;
- Consultation Report;
- Environmental Statement; and
- Transport Assessment.

1.3 The report sets out to provide a full assessment of the retail planning elements of the scheme. The coverage is as follows:

- Section 2: A brief summary of the application site and proposed retail development;
- Section 3: A summary and commentary on the relevant planning policy framework;
- Section 4: Definition of the catchment area and consideration of the existing shopping patterns;
- Section 5: A review of the health of Barry town centre;
- Section 6: An assessment of the quantitative and qualitative need for the proposed development;
- Section 7: An assessment of the scale of the proposed development;
- Section 8: A review of the availability, suitability and viability of alternative development sites (i.e. the sequential approach assessment);

- Section 9: An assessment of the retail impact of the proposed development on existing stores and centres;
- Section 10: Conclusions on the retail planning merits of the proposal.

2.0 Site and Proposed Development

Application Site

2.1 The Barry Waterfront site is located to the south-west of Barry town centre and is strategically positioned between the town centre, Barry Island and the Old Harbour. The site area within the red line is approximately 43 hectares. The site is bordered by the Cardiff-Barry Island railway line and a mix of residential, commercial and industrial property.

2.2 The site is largely vacant although part of the original site has been developed. The existing waterfront development comprises some 690 residential units together with a retail area incorporating a Morrisons food store and non-food retail units as well as a medical centre. To the north of the site, is the Innovation Quarter, which comprises a range of office and business starter units.

Proposed Development

2.3 Full details of the proposed development are set out in the accompanying Planning Statement. However, to summarise, the key elements of the development will comprise up to 2,000 dwellings, up to 8,825 sq m of gross retail floorspace (A1), up to 1,820 sq m cafes, bars and restaurants (A3), a hotel (C1) of up to 3,500 sq m, up to 3,450 sq m offices (B1) and significant improvements to infrastructure and transport links and public realm and open space provision.

Retail Element

2.4 As stated above, the proposed retail element of the scheme comprises up to 8,825 sq m (95,000 sq ft) gross retail floorspace for the sale of both food and non-food goods and a petrol filling station. The majority of the proposed retail floorspace will be located in the proposed 'District Centre' which is located to the north-west of the development site adjacent to West Pond, the proposed school site and the Innovation Centre.

2.5 The retail scheme will comprise approximately 6,525 sq m gross foodstore (approximately 4,600 sq m net) for which there is no proposed operator to date. It is envisaged that the store will sell both convenience and comparison goods with approximately a 60:40 split. As such, it is anticipated that 2,800 sq m (net) will be devoted to the sale of convenience goods and 1,800 sq m (net) will be devoted to the sale of comparison goods.

2.6 There will be a further 2,300 sq m gross non-food floorspace (approx 1,800 sq m net) provided within separate retail units adjacent to the proposed foodstore. The exact number of units is unknown at this stage of the application process although it is envisaged that there will be 2no. units of approximately 1,150 sq

m gross (900 sq m net) each. There are no proposed operators for these units to date.

Site Allocation and Retail Implications

- 2.7 The Barry Waterfront site is allocated within the Vale of Glamorgan UDP as a 'Comprehensive Redevelopment Area' and further allocates 11,148 sq m of the Barry Waterfront site for retail development (POLICY SHOP 3). The more recent Development Principles Document (Vale of Glamorgan, May 2009) also cites the Barry Waterfront scheme as providing a mix of uses including '*a range of appropriate retail uses*'.
- 2.8 The scheme is proposing to locate all retail floorspace into a District Centre which will be the commercial hub of the Waterfront. However, as this is still a proposed allocation, it is considered necessary to treat the proposed retail floorspace as being 'out of centre' as it is located approximately 800m walking distance from Barry town centre's defined Primary Shopping Area (as defined by the UDP).

3.0 **Relevant Planning Policy**

3.1 This section provides the framework of policy documents against which the planning application should be considered.

National Policy

- Planning Policy Wales (2002);
- Wales Spatial Plan (2008 Update);
- Ministerial Interim Planning Policy Statement (MIPPS) 02/2005 – Planning for Retailing and Town Centres (Updates 10.1 – 10.3 of PPW);
- Technical Advice Note 4: Retailing and Town Centres (1996).

Local Planning Policy

- The Vale of Glamorgan Unitary Development Plan 1996-2011 (Adopted 2005);
- The Vale of Glamorgan Draft Preferred Strategy (Published December 2008) – forms part of the emerging Local Development Plan;
- Barry Waterfront Development Principles Document (Adopted June 2009);

Vale of Glamorgan Retail Policy Evidence Base

3.2 Although the following documents do not form adopted planning policy they have been produced by the Council to inform emerging retail policy. As such due consideration will be had to these documents:

- The Vale of Glamorgan Retail Study (CACI, May 2009);
- The Vale of Glamorgan Town & District Retail Centre Appraisal (Martin Tonks, 2008).

Key Policy Considerations

3.3 A thorough review of all of the above national and local planning policy documents has revealed that there are 6 key themes that this Retail Assessment will need to consider. These are:

- a The policy status of the proposed development site;
- b The suitability of the development with regards to Barry's role within the Vale of Glamorgan's retail hierarchy;

- c The need for the proposed development;
- d The scale of the proposed development;
- e The suitability of the proposed location of development with regards to the sequential test;
- f The potential impact of the proposed development.

3.4 The policy status of the site is considered in Section 2 and the remaining issues are considered in the following sections.

4.0 Existing Retail Provision & Shopping Patterns

4.1 This section of the Retail Assessment starts by critiquing the Vale of Glamorgan's existing Retail Study. The existing retail hierarchy and main convenience and comparison shopping provision within the local area is then assessed as well as any existing proposals/commitments for additional retail floorspace. A description of the expected catchment area of the Barry Waterfront site is then provided followed by a summary of the main shopping patterns within the defined catchment, as established by a household survey.

The Vale of Glamorgan Retail Study (May 2009)

4.1 The Council commissioned property consultants CACI to undertake a Retail Study which was published in September 2008. Following publication of this document, NLP raised a number of concerns in March 2009 regarding the methodology CACI had adopted and the conclusions which were drawn regarding convenience capacity.

4.2 In the light of NLP's comments, CACI subsequently amended their retail study in May 2009 (published July 2009) with little explanation as to the reasoning behind the significant changes to the study. This amended study has made a number of conclusions relating to retail convenience and comparison floorspace capacity within the Vale of Glamorgan up to 2026. The key conclusions relating to Barry are as follows:

- a CACI's study area will see a population growth of 2.4% between 2007 and 2011 and 2.8% between 2011 and 2016.
- b Barry's resident convenience market is currently worth £123.2m (2007 base year) and it has a turnover potential of £147.4m, showing an in-flow of expenditure from the surrounding zones of £24.2m. Barry currently supports 65% of the Vale's convenience economy. The current turnover potential density (£11,943 per sq m net) is higher than the benchmark trading density of £10,000 per sq m. The zone therefore has capacity for new convenience floorspace, of 2,397 sq m net at 2007 rising to 3,803 sq m net by 2012 and 3,928 sq m net by 2026 (Paragraphs 1.10-1.11). On this basis, CACI states that "*there is clear opportunity for an additional supermarket for Barry town centre*" (Paragraph 5.5).
- c Barry town centre (Barry Town Centre & High Street/Broad St) draws strong performance from its high percentage (87%) of independent comparison retail, and despite the proximity of Cardiff it has a relatively strong hold on its primary catchment. The current turnover potential is £40.5m. At a target trading density for comparison goods of £3,000 per m², only small comparison headroom is currently supported – an addition of 577 sq m (net) at 2007. Under current population projections however, this headroom will increase to 2,976 sq m by 2012, reducing back down to 2,437 sq m by

2017 and 2,859 by 2026 (reduction is due to predicted growth in Special Forms of Trading). Barry's retail mix highlights the areas that would increase the appeal of Barry and reclaim more shoppers from secondary and tertiary catchments – the crucial categories that are underrepresented are clothing, leisure goods and electrical goods (Paragraph 4.16 and Figures 29.1-32.3).

- d CACI advise that in the event of a new application for convenience or comparison floorspace within Barry, the level of sustainable floorspace should be reassessed based upon the extent to which the specific proposal could be argued to claw-back spend from other areas, and it should be demonstrated how this will impact on the capacity for floorspace (and corresponding headroom) at other locations (Paragraphs 1.15 and 1.23).

4.3 The CACI study clearly supports the need for an additional foodstore within Barry which should be directed towards the town centre in the first instance (Paragraph 5.5). Indeed, CACI state that there is headroom capacity to support 2,976 sq m of additional convenience floorspace by 2012. Also CACI recognise that if proposed convenience or comparison floorspace has the ability to assist in the claw back of expenditure from surrounding competing centres the sustainable levels of floorspace could be re-assessed.

4.4 However, despite the fact that CACI have amended the Retail Study in light of some of our comments, we still have significant reservations regarding the robustness of the study and its appropriateness as a basis for assessing retail capacity. Below, we provide a brief summary of the key issues, although this list is by no means exhaustive:

- a Most importantly, in policy terms CACI do not distinguish between in centre and out of centre stores which is clearly an omission in terms of the usefulness of the study for planning policy purposes.
- b The study also does not allow for any inflow of expenditure from outside the study area.
- c We still do not consider that the estimated convenience turnover of certain stores is correct. For example, the Lidl in Cardiff is said to turnover at £23.9 million which is considered highly unrealistic for a store of this size and nature and means this store's turnover is effectively double the convenience turnover of M&S at Culverhouse Cross (as calculated by CACI). Also there is still a reference to Netto supermarket in Barry town centre which does not exist (Home Bargains is largely a comparison store with a small ancillary convenience offer). There are also several anomalies in terms of annual turnover potential of stores.
- d The net convenience capacity headroom has increased from -3,292 sq m at 2007 (original study) to +2,397 sq m (amended study) at 2007. This represents an increase in convenience capacity of 5,689 sq m with little explanation regarding the reason for the change.

e In paragraph 4.19 of the study CACI appear to have concern regarding the current turnover potential of Culverhouse Cross and comment that 'higher comparison goods figures are achieved in Retail Parks where there is a stronger presence of fashion retailers'. They also provide a scenario (Paragraph 4.13 and Figure 28.7) whereby 50% of the units at Culverhouse Cross are occupied by fashion retailers and refer to Culverhouse Cross as a 'centre'. CACI appear to imply that increased fashion retailing at Culverhouse Cross would be acceptable, whereas we believe such a proposal to be inappropriate given that Culverhouse Cross is not a designated centre and should not be promoted as a destination for fashion retailing.

4.5 On this basis, we do not consider that the CACI Retail Study provides a robust assessment of convenience or comparison floorspace capacity and with no distinction between in centre and out of centre retail floorspace we do not consider that the study can be utilised for the purposes of informing this Retail Assessment. As such, in the absence of a robust and useable Retail Study we consider it appropriate to provide our own retail capacity and impact assessment of the proposed retail element of the Barry Waterfront development proposals.

Martin Tonks Town & District Retail Centre Appraisal (2008)

4.6 Martin Tonks was commissioned by Vale of Glamorgan Council to undertake the above study in 2008 and his report was subsequently published in September of that year and has since been agreed by Cabinet.

4.7 The report essentially looks at the health of the major town shopping centre of Barry as well as the Vale's five District Centres. For each centre the report provides a SWOT analysis, looks at indicators of health such as commercial yields, vacancy rates etc and provides a series of recommendations for how the vitality and viability of each centre can be improved.

4.8 This Retail Assessment has regard to the comments made by Martin Tonks within this study, details of which are provided within the relevant sections.

Retail Hierarchy

4.9 Barry is the Vale of Glamorgan's only designated 'Major Town Shopping Centre' (Paragraph 7.1.5) and as such this designation emphasises the importance of maintaining and enhancing Barry's role as a main shopping destination within the Vale.

4.10 The Council's UDP designates five District Centres which are Penarth, Cowbridge, Llantwit Major, High Street/Broad Street in Barry and Upper Holton Road in Barry. There are also ten designated Local Centres (including Main Street and Vere Street in Cadoxton) and eleven designated Neighbourhood Centres (including Gibbonsdown centre and Cwm Talwg centre),

- 4.11 In terms of existing foodstores, the UDP allocates the former Netto foodstore in Barry (now occupied by Home Bargains) as an edge of centre store whilst Morrisons in Barry Waterfront, Waitrose at Cadoxton, Tesco at Penarth Marina, Tesco at Stirling Road Barry and Kwik Save at Penarth are all designated as 'out of centre developments'. Also, there are two designated 'out of town developments' which are Culverhouse Cross and A Place for Homes in Llandow (UDP, 7.1.5). A retail hierarchy plan is provided in Appendix 1.

Existing Convenience Shopping Provision

- 4.12 From our knowledge of the local area there is only one major foodstore located within Barry town centre, which is Iceland. This store has a top-up rather than main food shopping function. The majority of the other main food stores serving Barry and the surrounding area are located in out of centre locations. A summary of the key foodstores within the catchment area is provided below, together with an indication of the types of shopping being undertaken based on the results of our household survey (see below).

Morrisons, Penny Way

- 4.13 This 3,163 sq. m (net) Morrisons store is located on Penny Way off Ffordd Y Mileniwm. The store, which opened in 2001, is located out-of-centre and formed the first phase of the Barry Waterfront redevelopment. The store sells predominantly convenience goods with a relatively limited non-food offer and is used as both a main and top-up food shopping destination. The store has a petrol filling station and in store café.

Tesco, Stirling Road

- 4.14 This Tesco store is approximately 2,600 sq. m net and is located at the junction of Stirling Road/Port Road West which is an out of centre location along one of the main routes to Cardiff Airport. The store offers a range of non-food goods and also has a Tesco Direct home shopping facility. The store is used as both a main and top-up food shopping destination.

Waitrose, Palmerston Road

- 4.15 The Waitrose store, which is approximately 2,300 sq. m net, opened in 2004 in an out of centre location along Palmerston Road. It was previously occupied by Safeway. Waitrose predominantly sells convenience goods with a very limited non-food offer, has a petrol filling station and an in-store café. Although the store is used as a main food shopping destination by some residents, the majority use it as a top-up food shopping destination.

Lidl, Cennin Pedr

- 4.16 The Lidl store is located at Cennin Pedr in an out of centre location. The store, which has recently undergone extension to increase the net sales area to approximately 1,290 sq. m, provides a range of discounted food and non-food

products. The store is used as both a main and top-up food shopping destination although its top-up function is considered to be more significant.

Tesco, Culverhouse Cross

- 4.17 Tesco at Culverhouse Cross offers the largest foodstore within the local area at approximately 6,600 sq m (net). The store sells a wide range of both food and non-food goods and also benefits from a petrol filling station and in-store café, opticians and pharmacy. The store is predominantly used for main food shopping.

Tesco, Penarth Haven

- 4.18 Tesco at Penarth Haven offers approximately 2,400 sq m (net) floorspace in an out of centre location. The store sells food and a limited range of non-food goods and also benefits from a petrol filling station and photo processing desk. The store is used as both a main and top-up food shopping destination.

Existing Comparison Shopping Provision

- 4.19 The catchment area has a number of comparison shopping locations both in and outside designated town centres. Details of the key shopping destinations are summarised below.

Barry Town Centre

- 4.20 Barry town centre is concentrated along Holton Road, Thompson Street and Tynwydd Road and provides approximately 13,600 sq m of comparison floorspace (Goat Plan, October 2007). The centre has a variety of both multiple and independent retailers including Iceland, Peacocks, New Look, WH Smith and Wilkinson. The Martin Tonks Study (2008) states that the comparison sector has reasonable representation (although visitors would like to see more clothes shops), there is a very limited choice and range of convenience goods outlets and there is a good range of services.

Barry Waterfront Retail Park

- 4.21 This out of centre retail park is located to the south of Barry town centre. The park provides 6 retail units of which 4 units are occupied by comparison retailers including Instore, Halfords, Focus and Argos. The remaining 2 units are occupied by Morrisons and KFC.

Penarth Town Centre

- 4.22 Penarth is located to the east of Barry town centre and is designated as a district centre in The Vale's UDP. The Martin Tonks Study (2008) states that Penarth has a good range of non-food shops and town centre uses and for a small suburban district centre it has good representation of banks and financial services as well as specialist fashion shops.

Cowbridge District Centre

- 4.23 Cowbridge, located to the north west of Barry, is designated as a district centre in the Vale's UDP. Cowbridge's shopping centre is largely concentrated along High Street. The Martin Tonks study (2008) indicates that Cowbridge has a good and diverse range of non-food shops. In particular Cowbridge is regarded as providing specialist fashion and craft shops which draw visitors from a wide area.

Llantwit Major District Centre

- 4.24 Llantwit Major's main shopping area is located along Boverton Road. The Martin Tonks Study (2008) highlights that within Llantwit Major there appears to be a reasonable range of shops and town centre uses and for a small rural district centre diversity is quite good, although there is considered to be a limited range of clothes shops.

Culverhouse Cross

- 4.25 To the edge of the catchment area is Culverhouse Cross retail park which is located partially within the administrative boundary of The Vale of Glamorgan and partially within Cardiff. There are a number of comparison and bulky goods retailers at Culverhouse Cross including Comet, Dreams, PC World, Allied Carpets, Currys, Marks & Spencer, Tesco and Mothercare. This is a popular out of centre comparison shopping destination.

Outside the Catchment Area

- 4.26 Due to its location, Barry town centre experiences significant competition from centres outside of the catchment area. The main centre is Cardiff City Centre which has a wide range and diversity of comparison shops. Bridgend is also considered to be a popular comparison shopping location with national multiple retailers including Monsoon, Accessorise and Topshop. Furthermore, the out of town McArthur Glen factory outlet centre is located off Junction 36 of the M4 which offers a variety of discount comparison retailers including Karen Millen, Ted Baker and Marks & Spencer. All of these centres represent significant competition to Barry town centre.

Retail Allocations, Commitments and Recent Developments

- 4.27 The Vale of Glamorgan UDP allocates three sites (not including the Barry Waterfront site) for retail development. In addition, one other scheme has come forward as a commitment. Below provides a brief summary of each of these allocations/commitments.

Site 1: The Former Town Hall Site, Barry

- 4.28 This 1.2 hectare site was allocated as a 'major retail opportunity' within the UDP. Detailed planning consent was granted for the comprehensive redevelopment of this site in July 1996 with proposals including a new supermarket, several new retail outlets and a new library.

- 4.29 However, the site has now been developed as a new library, civic square and fully refurbished park and play area. No retail development has been provided as part of the scheme.

Site 2: 59-71 Holton Road, Barry

- 4.30 This site, which was formerly occupied by the Victoria Public House, was allocated in the UDP to provide modern and efficient retail floorspace with potential to occupy the upper floors for office or residential use.

- 4.31 The site has been cleared and an application was submitted in May 2008 for the erection of a Tesco Express foodstore. The application, which sought permission for the erection of a 430 sq m (gross) store, was granted planning permission in June 2008. At the time of writing construction was progressing on site.

Site 3: 1-7 Thompson Street, Barry

- 4.32 This site was allocated in the UDP as 'a strategically important site' which is '*at an entrance to the shopping centre but is in need of refurbishment to complement the recent improvements undertaken at the corner properties on Holton Road*'. Suitable uses were cited as being retailing at ground floor level with offices and/or residential above. This site is occupied by older-style existing shop units and there are no known proposals for the redevelopment of this area.

Lidl Store Extension, Cennin Pedr

- 4.33 In addition to the sites allocated within the UDP, an application to extend the existing Lidl store on Cennin Pedr was approved by the Vale of Glamorgan Council on 31st January 2007. The application sought to extend the store to increase the existing sales area from 871 sq m net to 1,286 sq m net (an increase of 415 sq m). The permission has since been implemented.

Tesco Express, Herbert Street, Penarth

- 4.34 A Tesco Express convenience store has opened at Herbert Terrace in Penarth which provides a further 250 sq m net (approx) convenience floorspace within the catchment area.

Other Commitments

- 4.35 There are no other significant retail commitments or allocations within the Vale or within the Catchment Area since the household survey was undertaken in March 2008.

- 4.36 However, outside the Catchment there is a 'major scheme' which is the proposed St David's 2 development in Cardiff City Centre. Planning permission was granted in July 2005 for this scheme which will provide a mixed use development comprising retail, leisure, library, residential, hotel, offices and

food and drink uses. The scheme will offer approximately 90,000 sq. m retail floorspace and is due to open in autumn 2009. Given its scale, the likely impact of the opening of this scheme is an increase in the amount of comparison expenditure leaking out from the catchment area to Cardiff.

- 4.37 Furthermore, since the household survey was completed the Capital Retail Park at Leckwith has since opened which offers 44,000 sq m of retail floorspace provided in 18 retail units. Not all units are occupied to date however tenants who have taken units include Asda, Hobbycraft, Next Home, Smyths Toy Shop, Mamas and Papas, JJB Fitness Club, Costa Coffee, Greggs and Marks & Spencer Home.

Retail Proposals

- 4.38 There is only one relevant retail proposal within the catchment area, details of which are provided below.

Barry Island Pleasure Park

- 4.39 An outline planning application for the redevelopment of Barry Island Pleasure Park (reference: 2008/01533/OUT) was submitted to the Council in November 2008 for the “*redevelopment of funfair for mixed use scheme to include leisure, residential, food and drink and retail uses*”. The scheme, which is currently undetermined, is seeking permission for approximately 3,215 sq m of A3 use and 605 sq m (gross) A1 use.
- 4.40 Whilst this scheme is located in close proximity to the site, the proposals are largely for a leisure complex with a small amount of retail floorspace which is to serve the scheme’s residents rather than visitors. As such it is anticipated that the unit will be occupied by a CTN, small scale convenience store or potentially service uses. Therefore, if this scheme does gain planning permission it will not undermine the retail element of the Barry Waterfront scheme.

Existing Shopping Patterns

- 4.41 On behalf of the Consortium we commissioned the market research company, Research and Marketing, to undertake a household survey in March 2008 to establish existing shopping patterns in the area. The survey comprised 1,006 telephone interviews and the catchment area was defined based on the location of existing and proposed large foodstores and other comparison retail shopping destinations such as Culverhouse Cross, Cardiff and Bridgend.
- 4.42 The catchment area consists of 20 postcode sectors to the north, east and west of Barry (see plan, Appendix 1). The area is estimated to have a population of 119,716 at 2009 (Table 1a, Appendix 4). This area has then been sub-divided into 8 zones based on postcode sectors in order to reflect areas with similar geography, accessibility and local shopping provision.

Zone	Postcode Sector
1	CF62 5, CF62 6, CF62 7, CF62 8, CF63 4
2	CF62 9, CF63 1, CF63 2, CF63 3
3	CF64 4, CF64 5
4	CF64 1, CF64 2, CF64 3
5	CF5 6
6	CF62 3, CF62 4
7	CF61 1, CF61 2
8	CF71 7

Table 1 Catchment Area Zones

4.43 The household survey results are attached at Appendix 2 and a summary of the main survey findings relating to both food and non-food shopping behaviour is provided below.

Main Food Shopping

4.44 Main food shopping by residents in the catchment area is dominated by the Morrisons in Barry (23%) followed by Tesco in Barry (16%), Tesco in Penarth (16%) and Tesco at Culverhouse Cross (10%). These four stores, which are all located out of centre, account for 65% of all main food shopping within the catchment area. A further 16% of main food shopping is completed in various shops located within the catchment area at Barry, Llantwit Major, Penarth, Culverhouse Cross and Cowbridge.

4.45 The survey shows that 18% of all main food expenditure leaks out to shops located outside the catchment area with the most popular locations being Tesco Extra at Bridgend (6%) and Asda in Cardiff Bay (5%).

4.46 Overall, Barry retains approximately 47% of main food expenditure within the catchment area. However 45% of this expenditure is being spent in stores outside the main town centre such as Tesco, Morrisons, Lidl and Waitrose. As such the town centre accounts for very little main food expenditure.

4.47 The main reasons given by respondents for shopping at their respective main food store was recorded as being convenience to home (48%), the range/availability of food products (20%), convenient/cheap (12%) and quality of goods (11%).

Other Main Food Shopping

4.48 The most popular destination for 'other main food' shopping within the catchment area as a whole is Morrisons in Barry (18%) followed by Tesco in Barry (13%), Waitrose in Barry (7%), Asda in Cardiff Bay (7%) and Marks & Spencer at Culverhouse Cross (6%).

4.49 In terms of expenditure retention, Barry retains approximately 48% of other main food expenditure which is largely similar to the results for main food

expenditure. Overall the catchment area retains approximately 79% of other main food' expenditure with 21% leaking to stores outside the catchment,

Top-up Food Shopping

- 4.50 Approximately 67% of respondents stated that they undertook a form of top-up food shopping. Of those respondents who did undertake top-up food shopping the most popular destination was Tesco in Barry (10%) followed by Morrisons in Barry (9%), 'other town centre, Penarth' (8%) and 'other out of centre, Barry' (7%).
- 4.51 The proportion of top-up food shopping retained within the Barry was approximately 39% and the catchment area retained 88% as a whole which, due to the nature of top-up food shopping, is to be expected. Leakage of expenditure was 12% which was absorbed by Asda and Morrisons in Cardiff Bay as well as other stores and centres outside the catchment.

Non Food Shopping

- 4.52 The survey asked respondents where they normally shop for clothing and footwear, kitchen and household goods, small electrical appliances and recreational and miscellaneous goods.
- 4.53 For clothing and footwear the most popular shopping destination was Cardiff which attracted 50% of expenditure followed by Barry town centre (14%), Culverhouse Cross (12%) and Barry out of centre (8%). Overall Barry retained approximately 21% of expenditure, the catchment area as a whole retained 38% whilst 62% leaked to stores and centres outside of the catchment area.
- 4.54 For kitchen and household goods Cardiff was again the most popular destination attracting 42% of expenditure followed by Barry town centre (15%), Culverhouse Cross (12%), Barry out of centre (10%) and Penarth (7%). Overall Barry retained approximately 24% of expenditure and the catchment area as a whole retained 45%. However, 55% of expenditure leaked to stores and centres outside the catchment area.
- 4.55 For small electrical appliances Cardiff was the most popular shopping destination attracting 26% of expenditure followed by Culverhouse Cross (22%), Barry town centre (15%) and Barry out of centre (14%). Barry retained approximately 29% of expenditure in total and the catchment area as a whole retained 60%. This means that approximately 40% of expenditure leaks to stores and centres outside the catchment.
- 4.56 Recreational and miscellaneous goods are mainly purchased in Cardiff (51%) followed by Barry town centre (18%). Overall Barry retained approximately 24% of expenditure and the catchment area as a whole retained just 37%. This means that approximately 63% of expenditure is absorbed by stores and centres located outside the catchment.

- 4.57 The results show that Cardiff is generally the most popular non food shopping destination particularly for recreational and miscellaneous goods as well as clothing and footwear. Barry was reasonably popular for all types of goods although there is a significant outflow of expenditure to out of centre stores and centres outside the catchment which will continue unless retail provision within Barry can be significantly improved.

Visiting Barry Town Centre

- 4.58 The respondents were asked how often they generally visit Barry Town Centre. Over a third of respondents claimed they never visited (35%), followed by less often than every month (17%), once a week (16%) and more than once a week (15%).
- 4.59 Of those who stated that they do visit Barry town centre, respondents were also asked what their main reasons were for visiting. The most frequently reported reason was to use bank/financial services (24%), followed by non-food shopping (22%), food shopping (13%) and leisure uses (7%).

Changes in Shopping Provision

- 4.60 Since the household survey was completed in March 2008 there have been some minor changes to retail provision within the catchment area which will need to be acknowledged within the quantitative assessment. These include the recently extended Lidl at Cennin Pedr, the Tesco Express in Penarth and the committed Tesco Express development at Holton Road in Barry – details of which are provided above.
- 4.61 Outside the Catchment Area a new Asda foodstore (approximately 5,450 sq m net) opened at Leckwith in Cardiff in October 2008. However, it is not considered that this will significantly impact on the existing shopping patterns of the Catchment Area's residents as the store is of similar size to the Asda at Cardiff Bay and of a similar distance. As such, it is likely to primarily divert trade from the existing Asda store.
- 4.62 Furthermore, a new Asda store (approximately 5,650 sq m net) opened in Bridgend in November 2007. Whilst this predates the household survey it was not provided as an answer by the respondents which appears unusual given the popularity of the nearby Tesco Extra store. An explanation for this could be simply that the store had not established its trading pattern at the time of the survey and thus was not considered to be their normal shopping destination by any of the respondents. Alternatively, the additional distance involved in travelling to the store may mean people prefer to continue to use the Tesco Extra. In any event, given the distance of the store, it is considered that it is unlikely to impact on the existing shopping patterns of residents other than by taking a small element of trade from the Tesco Extra store at Bridgend.

5.0 Barry Town Centre

5.1 To assist in assessing the current levels of vitality and viability in the catchment area, it is necessary to consider the current health of Barry as the closest town centre to the proposals for the Waterfront. A health check of Barry town centre is provided by the recently published *Martin Tonks Town and District Retail Centre Appraisal* (2008). However, this study does not include detailed information regarding all the TAN4 health check indicators. Therefore, whilst NLP has had full regard to this study we have also considered the following indicators as set out in TAN4:

- a Diversity of town centre uses;
- b Retailer representation and change;
- c Shopping rents and commercial yields; and
- d The proportion of vacant street level property.

Diversity of Town Centre Uses

5.2 The Martin Tonks study does not provide detailed information on retail floorspace within Barry. However, the study comments that the comparison sector has reasonable representation, there is a very limited choice and range of convenience goods outlets and banks and financial services are well represented.

5.3 The latest GOAD plan available for Barry town centre is dated October 2007. NLP therefore updated this plan in July 2009 and identified that Barry has approximately 24,920 sq m gross retail floorspace of which approximately 1,340 sq m is in convenience use, 13,580 sq m is in comparison use and 4,550 sq m is dedicated to retail services. A copy of the updated Goad Plan is provided in Appendix 3.

5.4 In their retail study, CACI has stated that Barry has 128no comparison units occupying 12,938 sq m (net) of floorspace. These figures are significantly different to those provided by Goad. The CACI study states that the floorspace estimates are based on the 2007 Vale of Glamorgan audit data of gross floorspace estimates and they have then applied a 70% gross to net ratio. This would mean they are working on a gross figure of approximately 18,500 sq m. We have been unable to get a copy of this report in order to ascertain the differences between the data sets. However, the most likely explanation is simply that different areas were surveyed or there were differences in what has been counted as a comparison unit.

- 5.5 On the basis that we do not know the area referred to by CACI and Goad provides a full breakdown of unit types and floorspace, the Goad figures will be adopted for the remaining analysis.

Use	Number of Units	Proportion of Total Number of Units (%)		Amount of floorspace (sq m gross)	Proportion of Total Floorspace (%)	
		Barry	UK Average		Barry	UK Average
Convenience	9	5.9%	9.1%	1,340	5.4%	16.7%
Comparison	60	39.5%	45.0%	13,580	54.5%	50.9%
Service	48	31.6%	33.3%	4,550	18.3%	21.8%
Vacant	33	21.7%	11.3%	5,040	20.2%	9.5%
Miscellaneous	2	1.3%	1.3%	410	1.6%	1.1%
Total	152	100.0%	100.0%	24,920	100.0%	100.0%

Table 2 Mix of Uses in Barry Town Centre

- 5.6 As can be seen from the above table, Barry has significantly less convenience floorspace than the UK average although it broadly follows the UK average for comparison, miscellaneous and service uses, which is largely in line with the comments of Martin Tonks. Most significantly, both the vacant number of units and percentage of vacant floorspace are effectively double the UK average (see below).

Retailer Representation

- 5.7 In their retail study, CACI highlights that Barry has a good diversity of retailers with a strong number of independent traders. However, it was identified that there is a need for Barry to increase its representation in clothing, leisure and electrical goods.
- 5.8 In terms of retail mix, NLP found there to be 152 retail units within the centre, of which 60 (39%) are comparison retail units, 48 (32%) service units and 9 (6%) convenience units.
- 5.9 There are a number of national multiple as well as independent retailers within Barry town centre. Key multiple retailers include Iceland, Boots, Peacocks, WH Smith, Clinton Cards, Dorothy Perkins, New Look, Burtons, Superdrug, Greggs and Wilkinsons. The largest units within the centre are occupied by Home Bargains and Wilkinsons. The former Woolworths store is currently vacant.
- 5.10 The convenience offer within the town centre is relatively poor with the only foodstore being Iceland, although a Tesco Express is currently under construction. There are also two Greggs the bakers, two CTN's, two health food shops, a butchers and a greengrocers.
- 5.11 Services include the key high street banks and building societies, estate agents and travel agents as well as a number of health and beauty outlets, cafes, takeaways and restaurants. Other services within the town centre, which are

not counted on the Goad plan as service units, include the library, job centre and the Civic offices.

Shopping Rents and Yields

5.12 The Martin Tonks study states that whilst Barry's commercial yield is 7.5% which "*compares unfavourably with most competing centres at least investor confidence is improving and Barry is not being left behind the rest of South Wales*" (Paragraph 6.6).

5.13 Building on the work of Martin Tonks we have obtained shopping yields from the Valuation Office. The last report for Wales was produced in July 2008 and the table below shows the changes in commercial yield over the past three years (the lower the yield; the healthier the centre).

Shopping Centre	Jul-05	Jan-06	Jul-06	Jan-07	Jul-07	Jan-08	Jul-08
Cardiff	4.50	4.00	4.00	4.00	4.00	4.00	4.00
Culverhouse Cross	5.75	5.75	5.75	5.75	5.75	5.75	6.00
Bridgend	7.50	7.00	7.00	6.75	6.75	5.75	7.25
Barry	8.50	8.00	8.00	7.50	7.50	7.50	7.50

Table 3 Commercial Yields in South Wales

5.14 The above table appears to indicate that Barry is steadily improving as a town centre in terms of yield whilst Cardiff and Culverhouse Cross have essentially remained the same over the three year period and Bridgend has shown significant fluctuation. However, Barry's yield is higher than Cardiff, Culverhouse Cross and Bridgend's yields and is therefore less attractive to investors which is consistent with the comments of Martin Tonks.

5.15 Colliers CRE produce in-town retail rent reports by region, with the last such report produced for Wales in May 2007. This report, although two years old, provides a useful insight into the relative attractiveness of Barry town centre. The report shows Barry's shopping rent to be £50 per sq ft. This can be compared to Cardiff at £300 per sq ft, Bridgend at £70 per sq ft and Pontypridd at £60 per sq ft. The nearest centres with similar rents are Port Talbot (£55 per sq ft) and Blackwood (£45 per sq ft).

Proportion of Vacant Street Level Property

5.16 There are currently 33 vacant units within Barry town centre which equates to 21.7% of all retail units. The UK average for vacant properties is 11.4% (Goad, April 2009) and therefore vacancies in Barry are effectively double this figure. The vacant units (with the exception of Woolworths) are relatively small units and many are in a poor state of repair. This means retailers are unable to move straight into the units that are available, which is an issue in an already economically challenging market. The relative size of the units also presents problems and is reflected in the Martin Tonks study which states that "*there is still a shortage of units suitable for multiple retailers*".

- 5.17 The current economic climate has seen the closure of a number of shops in Barry in recent months including Bay Trading, Birthdays, Ferraris the Bakers and most high profile – Woolworths. However, Adams children’s wear, a multiple which has undergone considerable national rationalization recently, still remains open in Barry, indicating it is one of the company’s better performing stores.
- 5.18 The 2009 updated Goad plan, shows that 19 of the 33 vacant units have remained vacant since October 2007 or earlier. However, it is worth noting that 9 of the previously vacant units at 2007 have since been re-occupied. There are also clear signs of active investment within Barry town centre, with the construction of a new Tesco Express store currently underway at the junction of Evans Street/Holton Road. This continues recent trends which are reflected in the Martin Tonks Study. This states that *“the phased programme of public realm improvements suggests increased private sector confidence in the primary shopping area with the opening in 2008 of Subway and Holland and Barratt”*.
- 5.19 The highest concentration of vacant units is to the western end of Holton Road. However, it is within this location that the Tesco Express is being constructed and therefore it is anticipated that this development will help improve the vitality and viability of this area of the town centre.

Conclusion

- 5.20 Both NLP and the Martin Tonks Study have found that Barry is still attracting much investment, which is a good indication that the retail offer will improve. The commercial yield is also falling and new developments such as the Tesco Express will assist in maintaining and enhancing the vitality and viability of the centre. However, there is still a need to help encourage and facilitate new retailers into Barry.
- 5.21 As identified by Martin Tonks, a key issue facing Barry’s retail future is the fact that the town is constrained by a number of small, poor quality units which simply do not meet the requirements of many of the key multiple retailers. Therefore, there is a clear need to provide units which are suitable for multiple retailers who tend to favour large modern units which they are able to move straight into.
- 5.22 Until this is done the town and surrounding area will continue to see trade leaking from the area and Barry will not fulfil its role as the Vale’s main shopping destination.

6.0 Retail Need

6.1 As discussed in Section 2, the Barry Waterfront site is considered out of centre for the purposes of this RA. TAN 4 and MIPPS 02/2005 require applicants for retail development on out of centre sites to demonstrate a quantitative and qualitative need for development. As such, in order to provide a robust assessment this section seeks to demonstrate the quantitative and qualitative need for the proposed scheme.

Quantitative Convenience Retail Capacity

6.2 Section 4 sets out the reasons why the Vale of Glamorgan Council's Retail Study has not been used to inform this Retail Assessment. As such, the methodology used for assessing convenience capacity is provided below.

Methodology

6.3 The main steps in estimating convenience goods capacity are as follows:

- a Calculate the quantum of convenience goods expenditure within the Catchment Area, based on population and per capita expenditure. The population projections have been derived from Vale of Glamorgan population and housing topic paper which applies growth rates based on 500 dwellings per annum based on SEWSPG data. However, it should be noted that this retail proposal is linked to the development of up to 2,000 residential units immediately adjacent to the site. This will have a significant effect on local expenditure capacity;
- b Calculate the benchmark turnover of existing and committed convenience floorspace within the Catchment Area and estimate the proportion of this turnover which is derived from the Catchment Area;
- c Estimate the surplus expenditure available to support new convenience floorspace based on the difference between the residual expenditure in the Catchment Area and the turnover of existing floorspace derived from the Catchment Area.

6.4 We have assessed quantitative retail need for 2009 and 2012 (the design year) using a price base of 2007 throughout. This is based on planning permission being granted 2009/2010, construction being undertaken 2010/2011, and the opening of the retail units in 2011, with a year to establish settled trading patterns. This is considered reasonable for the purposes of this assessment.

6.5 As discussed in Section 4 of this RA, the Catchment Area for the need assessment is based upon the eight household survey zones listed in Table 1 (Section 4) and shown on the plan provided in Appendix 1.

Convenience Capacity Assessment

- 6.6 Our full convenience retail capacity assessment tables are set out in Appendix 4 and we provide a written summary of the findings below.
- 6.7 The population of the Catchment Area at 2009 is estimated to be 120,448 rising to 121,570 by 2012. Using these population figures (Table 1a) and the convenience expenditure figures (Table 2a), we have estimated that there is a total of £201.5 million available convenience expenditure in the catchment at 2009 rising to £204.5 million by 2012 (Table 3a) (2007 prices).
- 6.8 We have calculated the total convenience benchmark turnover of existing and committed convenience floorspace within the CA. This is £181.2m at 2012, of which an estimated £135.9 million turnover is derived from residents living within the Catchment Area (Table 4a).
- 6.9 Therefore, as shown by Table 4a, if all stores are trading at benchmark turnover levels there will be residual convenience expenditure capacity of £68.6 million to support new convenience floorspace at 2012.
- 6.10 We have not allowed for any structural outflow of expenditure as it is considered reasonable for the study area to seek to retain as much expenditure as possible within the catchment area which largely reflects the Vale of Glamorgan authority boundary. However, in reality, this existing surplus capacity will either be going to stores inside the catchment and thus these stores will be 'overtrading' or it will be leaking out of the catchment area to larger stores such as the Tesco Extra in Bridgend and Asda at Cardiff Bay.

Convenience Turnover of the Proposal

- 6.11 Due to the fact that there is no named operator for the proposed foodstore it has been necessary to calculate an average convenience turnover. This is based on the turnover of Asda and Tesco, the two major operators to have indicated an interest in occupying the store. They are also the top two UK supermarket retailers, and thus this will provide a robust estimate.
- 6.12 The company benchmark convenience turnover for Tesco is £12,611 per sq m and for Asda is £15,068 per sq m. As such the average turnover of Tesco and Asda is £13,840 per sq m (NLP estimate based on Verdict UK Grocery Food and Retailers Report 2009) which when applied to the convenience floorspace figure of 2,800 sq m (net), provides a proposed total turnover of £38.8 million at 2012 of which 90% or £34.9 million is assumed to be derived from the Catchment Area (see Table 5a). The remaining 10% will be achieved through expenditure inflow, ie visitors to Barry from outside the catchment area. This level of inflow is considered reasonable given Barry's existing and future role as a visitor destination.
- 6.13 As can be seen from Table 4a (Appendix 4) and in the table below, there is residual convenience expenditure of £68.6 million at 2012 if existing stores are

trading at benchmark level. There is therefore sufficient expenditure capacity to support the new convenience floorspace of the proposed foodstore with a further £33.7 million convenience expenditure remaining to support additional convenience floorspace within the Catchment Area at 2012.

Available convenience expenditure in catchment area (£m)	£68.6
Proposed turnover of convenience floorspace (£/m)	£13,840
Proposed convenience floorspace sq m net	2,800
Proposed total turnover from convenience goods	£38.8
Proposed convenience turnover from catchment area (90%)	£34.9
Residual convenience expenditure in catchment area post proposal (£m)	£33.7

Table 4 Convenience Capacity Summary

Quantitative Comparison Retail Capacity

Introduction

- 6.14 The Catchment Area (as identified on the plan provided in Appendix 1) and years tested for the comparison retail capacity assessment are the same as that used for the convenience retail capacity assessment. This is because the comparison floorspace within the proposed supermarket will be ancillary to its primary function as a foodstore and as such the proposed trade draw will come from the same area. The separate comparison units would also be expected to have a similar catchment area given that Barry is the main town centre shopping destination within the Catchment Area. Our full comparison retail capacity assessment tables are set out in Appendix 5.

Methodology

- 6.15 As discussed in Section 4 of this report, the CACI study states that in the event of a retail application proposal *“the level of sustainable floorspace should be reassessed based upon the extent to which the specific proposal could be argued to claw-back spend from other areas and how this will impact on the capacity for floorspace”*. This is due to the fact that there is a high level of comparison expenditure leakage to other stores and centres outside of Barry. CACI state that *“Barry’s retail mix highlights the areas that would increase the appeal of Barry and reclaim more shoppers from secondary and tertiary catchments – the crucial categories that are under-represented are Clothing, Leisure Goods and Electrical Goods”*. Martin Tonks also comments that despite the high vacancy rate within the town centre there is *“still a shortage of units suitable for multiple retailers”*.
- 6.16 CACI do not provide a figure to demonstrate the extent of comparison expenditure leakage. However, NLP have derived figures from the NLP household survey (March 2008) to demonstrate this level of leakage which is provided in the table below.

	Zone 1	Zone 2	Zone 3	Zone 4	Zone 5	Zone 6	Zone 7	Zone 8	Total
Barry Town Centre	32%	36%	8%	1%	6%	10%	6%	1%	15%
Barry out of centre	16%	11%	3%	1%	0%	9%	3%	1%	7%
Culverhouse Cross	8%	8%	9%	6%	18%	11%	6%	8%	8%
Inside Catchment Area Other	1%	1%	11%	18%	4%	7%	12%	16%	8%
Outside Catchment Area Other	43%	44%	69%	74%	72%	63%	73%	74%	61%
Total	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%

Source: Household survey results weighted as follows: 24% clothing and footwear; 11% kitchen and household goods; 11% small electrical appliances; 54% recreational and miscellaneous goods.

Table 5 Comparison Expenditure by Zone

6.17 The table shows that approximately 61% of all available comparison expenditure leaks to stores located outside of the Catchment Area. Whilst it would be considered inappropriate for Barry to absorb even a majority of this expenditure, there is clear scope to increase the appeal of Barry in order to retain a greater proportion of the available expenditure, particularly within the immediate Barry area.

6.18 As noted throughout the CACI Retail Study and the Martin Tonks Town and District Retail Centre Appraisal there is a need to improve Barry's retail offer by attracting multiple retailers and in particular clothing, electrical and leisure good retailers. These are the types of retailers that Barry Waterfront will target to occupy the proposed comparison units which, due to their proposed size, will be marketed to national multiple retailers. As such, the proposed methodology for analysing comparison retail need will be based on the Barry Waterfront scheme's ability to claw back available comparison expenditure to the town.

Comparison Capacity and Scope for Claw Back

6.19 The available comparison expenditure within the catchment area is expected to increase by over £17.7m between 2007 and 2012 (Table 3b, Appendix 5) but there is also considerable potential to increase the proportion of trade retained within Barry.

6.20 As Table 3b demonstrates, the available comparison expenditure will be £353.7m at 2012, but, as the Household Survey (March 2008) suggests, outlets in Barry will only attract 22% (£77.8m) of this expenditure, if market share remains unchanged. This represents just fifth of the total expenditure available.

6.21 The proposed development at Barry Waterfront would be expected to attract back an element of the comparison trade currently going to foodstores outside of the catchment area, (currently 18% of total convenience trade) and, through the provision of comparison retailers, some of the trade currently going to Culverhouse Cross, Bridgend or Cardiff (including both in and out of centre destinations).

6.22 From an analysis of current shopping patterns we believe that it is possible for the proposed development to increase the market share of stores in Barry in a

way similar to that set out in Table 4b. This, combined with the forecast increase in comparison expenditure means that there is significant capacity for additional comparison development within Barry provided it is of a form that will attract the national multiples currently missing from the town due to the lack of suitable accommodation. As Table 4b demonstrates, just a small amount of claw back from Cardiff, Culverhouse Cross and other major centres/retail parks outside the catchment area could provide in excess of £25m by 2012 to support new floorspace.

Comparison Turnover of the Proposal

- 6.23 It is estimated that the comparison element of the proposed supermarket would have a turnover of approximately £9,035 per sq m (NLP estimate based on Verdict figures for Tesco and Asda – 2007 prices – Table 5b) which would equate to £16.3 million at 2012 of which £14.6 million will be derived from the Catchment Area (Table 5b).
- 6.24 The comparison element of the other non-food retail floorspace proposed within the scheme will have an estimated turnover of approximately £4,498 per sq m (as the operators of the proposed units are not known we have considered the type of operators who might be interested in the units and estimated an average – see Table 5b for details). This would equate to an estimated turnover of £8.1 million at 2012 of which £7.3 million would be derived from the Catchment Area.
- 6.25 As such, the combined benchmark turnover of the scheme from the sale of comparison goods would be £24.4 million at 2012 with £21.9 million derived from the Catchment Area.

Uplift in Retention

- 6.26 As demonstrated above, the expected growth in comparison expenditure by 2012 together with a modest increase in trade retention as a result of less leakage to large foodstores and other retail outlets outside the catchment area will result in excess of £25m being available to support new floorspace in Barry. This is more than sufficient to support the proposed development.
- 6.27 In conclusion, the ability of the proposed floorspace to claw back expenditure more than justifies the amount of proposed comparison floorspace at Barry Waterfront and shows that there is significant capacity to support the additional comparison floorspace proposed up to 2012 and beyond.

Qualitative Retail Need

- 6.28 Barry tops the retail hierarchy for the Vale of Glamorgan but as established in Section 5 of this RA it is currently not fulfilling its role as the authority's major shopping destination due to poor quality retail provision and a lack of development opportunity. The poor quality of the existing retail provision is further compounded by the fact that due to the town's position within close

proximity to Cardiff and Bridgend, residents have a wide choice of available alternative shopping destinations both in and out of centre. As such, much of the convenience and comparison expenditure is leaking out to centres and stores outside of the catchment area.

- 6.29 In order to claw back some of this expenditure there is a clear need to improve Barry's retail offer which is a view also shared by CACI (Paragraph 5.4). Whilst the existing convenience offer is reasonable, there are few foodstores within the catchment of the size proposed at Barry Waterfront and therefore larger stores beyond the Catchment such as Asda at Cardiff Bay, Tesco Extra and Asda in Bridgend and Tesco at Culverhouse Cross are more appealing. Therefore it is considered that there is a need for a large foodstore at Barry to reduce this amount of leakage.
- 6.30 The retention of comparison expenditure within both Barry and the catchment area as a whole is poor. Therefore, there is significant scope to improve the comparison retail offer within Barry to claw back some of this expenditure currently leaking to Cardiff, Bridgend, Culverhouse Cross and McArthur Glen. However, it is considered that the only way the comparison offer will be improved is to provide purpose built retail units of a size and nature as to be attractive to key multiple retailers whom have the ability to significantly strengthen the retail offer.
- 6.31 The proposed Waterfront development therefore has the ability to provide these units which can be marketed to key retailers which are currently lacking within the town centre with potential units that they can move straight into, thereby making claw back achievable.

7.0 Scale

7.1 MIPPS 02/2005 sets out that the scale, type and location of out-of-centre retail developments should not be such as to be likely to undermine the vitality, attractiveness and viability of those town centres that would otherwise serve the community well, and should not be not be allowed if they would be likely to put town centre strategies at risk (Paragraph 10.3.12).

7.2 The proposed development consists two elements, the first of which is a foodstore of approximately 4,600 sq m net. The table below illustrates that although the proposed foodstore is larger than the existing Morrisons store in Barry, it is smaller than many of the existing foodstores in or just beyond the Catchment Area.

Store	Floorspace (sq m net)
Waitrose, Barry	2,300
Tesco, Penarth	2,350
Tesco, Barry	2,600
Morrisons, Barry	3,150
Sainsbury's, Bridgend	4,300
Proposed Foodstore, Barry Waterfront	4,600
Tesco Extra, Bridgend	5,300
Tesco, Talbot Green	5,300
Asda, Leckwith	5,400
Asda, Cardiff Bay	5,600
Asda, Bridgend	5,650
Tesco, Culverhouse Cross	6,600

Table 6 Scale of Existing Foodstores in Local Area

7.3 The store is therefore considered appropriate in scale for its catchment and similar to other nearby food stores. As such, it will be large enough to meet the needs of the local population and should contribute to increasing the rate of expenditure retention within the Catchment Area without a detrimental effect on existing town centres.

7.4 The second element of the retail proposal is for 2,300 sq m gross (1,800 sq m net) comparison floorspace. As stated, it is anticipated that provision will form 2no. units of approximately 1,150 sq m (gross) each.

7.5 To put this into perspective, the Barry Waterfront Retail Park offers 4 comparison retail units (Argos, Halfords, Instore and Focus) with a combined floorspace of 5,110 sq m (gross). The proposed comparison retail element thereby equates to half of this floorspace.

7.6 The Martin Tonks Study (2008) states that there is a shortage of units suitable for multiple retailers and recommends that the Council should “encourage the

main landowners in the town centre to create more large retail footprints in existing premises to attract new national multiple to Barry” (Paragraph 6.20). As such, it is clear that there is a need for larger units within Barry and it is considered that the proposed development promotes opportunities to provide these required larger units in an area which can accommodate shop units of the scale, type and format required.

8.0 Sequential Approach

8.1 Section 6 sets out the needs for the proposed convenience and comparison floorspace to be developed at the Barry Waterfront site. In this section we set out the approach used and findings from the sequential analysis undertaken in respect of the proposal.

8.2 However, from the outset it must be realised that should a sequentially preferable site be identified, then the benefits of developing the alternative site will need to be compared with those that would be derived from the development of the Waterfront site. This is due to the fact that the Waterfront is a strategic site earmarked for regeneration and as such, development of an alternative site will not provide the strategic regeneration benefits which will be achieved at the Waterfront.

Methodology

8.3 The methodology adopted in our sequential assessment can be summarised as follows:

- a Analyse the proposed catchment area and identify suitable locations for the proposed retail floorspace;
- b Sites which fall within or on the edge of these centres are considered later in the process as well as out of centre sites which are considered to be geographically closer to those identified centres than the proposal site;
- c The site characteristics are set out, acknowledging the need to be flexible, in accordance with guidance set out in MIPPS 02/2005;
- d A search for sequentially more preferable sites within the town centre is undertaken and sites evaluated as appropriate.

Area of Search

8.4 The proposed retail floorspace is intended to meet the need for additional convenience and comparison floorspace within Barry and its hinterland. However, as the site is currently in an out-of-centre location, MIPPS 02/2005 requires the applicant to demonstrate that a sequential approach has been adopted. The closest designated retail centre is Barry town centre. Barry is also considered to be the most appropriate location for large scale retail given that it is the Vale of Glamorgan's main retail centre. The area of the search therefore seeks to identify those sites which in policy terms, are either in centre, or on the edge of Barry town centre or closer geographically than the proposal site.

8.5 The Vale of Glamorgan UDP defines a Primary Shopping Area which runs along part of Holton Road and the western side of Ty-Newydd Road. For the purposes of this assessment we have therefore used this as the area which could be considered 'in centre'.

8.6 TAN 4 refers to edge of centre sites as 'a location within easy walking distance of the centre normally not more than 200-300 metres from existing town centre shops'. Therefore, to define 'edge-of-centre' sites, we first measured 300m from the designated shopping frontage in Barry and then adjusted the boundary slightly to take into account natural barriers such as the railway line and road network. The resulting area of search is marked on the plan provided in Appendix 6.

Flexibility

8.7 In line with guidance within MIPPS 02/2005 (Paragraph 10.3.5) we have sought to be flexible in terms of:

- the scale of development;
- the format of development;
- car parking provision; and
- the scope for disaggregation.

8.8 Scale has been discussed in Section 7 of this retail assessment where it was concluded that the proposals are appropriate in terms of the individual elements. Further, we believe the overall scale of a foodstore and two non-food units is appropriate to the proposed District Centre function.

8.9 However, for the purposes of the sequential assessment we have sought to disaggregate the proposed units with the minimum unit size forming the basis of the sequential site criteria. The smallest element would be the individual comparison units, which it is assumed will comprise 2no. units of approximately 1,150 sq m gross each. Therefore, as a minimum, sites need to be able to accommodate a building footprint of between 1,150 sq m gross. For the purposes of the sequential assessment, it is assumed that there will be no need to make an allowance for car parking, if public car parking is available nearby.

Identification of Sites

8.10 Potential sequential sites were identified by the following means:

- a Sites identified within the Vale of Glamorgan UDP for retail development within Barry;
- b Sites identified within the Council's Retail Study and Town & District Centre Appraisal as being suitable for development;

- c Vacant units within Barry town centre as identified from NLP's update of the Goad plan (July 2009);
- d Sites located in centre, edge or out of centre which appeared to be vacant or undergoing works from NLP site visit undertaken in July 2009.

Assessment of Sites

- 8.11 In assessing potential sites for development NLP have sought to be flexible and realistic and have assessed the identified sites against the MIPPS 02/2005 guidance.
- 8.12 The planning suitability of the site is considered by reference to the site's location relative to the Vale of Glamorgan's UDP defined primary shopping area, physical capacity and design constraints, access and land use.
- 8.13 Viability is considered in terms of a judgement on whether commercial operators are likely to find it a viable proposition for retail development. Availability will also be considered, including whether there may be a more appropriate use for the sites identified.
- 8.14 Whilst we have used a low threshold to identify sites (e.g. 1,150 sq m gross), the reality is that the foodstore would need to be significantly larger than this and therefore, whilst a site may be identified that can accommodate a single unit, it does not necessarily mean it would be suitable or able to accommodate the larger foodstore unit or the larger scheme, albeit it could be in a different format to that proposed.
- 8.15 Informed by this assessment, a conclusion is then reached as to whether the site is sequentially preferable.

Sequential Sites

- 8.16 Within the area of search, four sites were identified within the Vale of Glamorgan UDP for retail purposes including the Barry Waterfront site. Two of the sites (Former Town Hall and 59-71 Holton Road) have/are being developed (as discussed in Section 4 of this RA) and the final site, 1-7 Thompson Street, represents an area of just 740 sq m which currently accommodates existing occupied shop units. As such, none of the designated retail areas are considered to be either available or suitable for the proposed development.
- 8.17 The CACI Retail Study (2009) does not identify any sites suitable for development within the town centre. The Martin Tonks Study (2008) identifies that the main opportunities for development within the centre are: *"the small development site adjacent to the Wilkinsons store on Holton Road and the potential to create larger floorplates in existing units"* (Paragraph, 6.9).
- 8.18 The small development plot referred to relates to the Tesco Express which is currently under construction and can therefore be discounted. In terms of

creating larger floorplates, the only clear existing opportunity is to refurbish the 3no. adjacent vacant units at 77-81 Holton Road to provide a single larger unit. However, this would still only provide a unit of approximately 450 sq m which is well below the 1,150 sq m threshold and can thereby be discounted. Whilst it is accepted that opportunity may exist to create larger units, this would significantly impact on the number and therefore range of units within the centre. There are also significant issues regarding ownership and availability. As such, it is not considered feasible to provide the floorspace required through the amalgamation of existing units.

- 8.19 There are a number of existing vacant units located within or on the edge of Barry town centre (a full list is provided in Appendix 6). However, the majority of these units are small, measuring well below the required 1,150 sq m (gross) floorspace. As a result of their size, such units clearly could not accommodate the type of floorspace being proposed at Barry Waterfront. These units are therefore not assessed in detail in the sequential site analysis (Appendix 6). However, one unit has been identified, details of which are summarised below and provided in full in Appendix 6.
- 8.20 **Site 1** is the former Woolworths unit located along Holton Road within the primary shopping area. The site offers approximately 1,100 sq m (gross) of retail floorspace over one level.
- 8.21 Since the closure of the Woolworths store in January 2009 the store has remained vacant. The unit was being actively marketed by Emanuel Jones Chartered Surveyors who have confirmed that the unit is currently under offer.
- 8.22 Although the site is 50 sq m below the gross minimum floorspace requirement it was considered expedient to include it within the search given that it is a prominent unit within the town centre. However, there are no opportunities to further expand the floorspace and therefore, the unit could accommodate only a small element of the proposed scheme. Furthermore, it now seems the unit is unavailable and will be occupied before 2012 given the unit's prominent position, the lack of large units in the centre and the fact that it is already attracting interest from retailers.

Sequential Conclusions

- 8.23 A flexible, yet realistic approach has been adopted in searching for opportunities to meet the identified convenience and comparison retail floorspace needs in Barry town centre and edge of centre locations.
- 8.24 The need to provide the proposed retail floorspace at Barry Waterfront and not disaggregate has been demonstrated, yet the search for sites has considered sites down to 1,150 sq m gross thereby contemplating disaggregation on a theoretical basis.

- 8.25 One town centre site was identified which could accommodate an element of the proposed retail floorspace (1,100 sq m gross). This site was considered to be suitable and viable but is not available.
- 8.26 It is considered that the results of the above sequential site search have been largely validated by the Martin Tonks study which concluded that the only development opportunities within the town is a site adjacent to Wilkinsons (currently being developed as a Tesco Express) and potential to create larger floorplates in existing units (although no specific units/groups of units are referred).
- 8.27 We therefore conclude that there are no sequentially preferable sites that could accommodate a foodstore and the proposed comparison units. On this basis, it is necessary to look out of centre to meet the identified need and as such it would appear that Barry Waterfront, as a strategic designated site, represents the most appropriate location and most efficient use of land to meet the need.

9.0 Town Centre Impacts

9.1 We have undertaken a retail impact assessment to estimate the convenience and comparison trade diversion from individual foodstores, Barry town centre and other centres in and beyond the defined catchment area of the proposed scheme. The convenience trade diversion analysis is set out in Tables 1c - 6c in Appendix 7, whilst the comparison trade diversion is set out in Tables 1d – 5d in Appendix 8.

9.2 We use the same catchment area zones as in the retail capacity analysis (Section 6).

Convenience Trade Diversion

9.3 The main steps in estimating convenience trade diversion are as follows:

- Calculate the pre-proposal implied turnover of the identified main food stores and convenience shops in 2009 and 2012 by applying the market shares from the Household Survey to the convenience expenditure for the Catchment Area.
- Calculate the likely turnover of any retail proposals and/or commitments which will be trading before 2012.
- Estimate the expected trading pattern and trade draw of the proposed convenience floorspace.
- Calculate the expected turnover of existing stores in 2012 following the proposed development, based on market share adjustments.
- The expected trade diversion is the numerical difference in the pre- and post-proposal turnover from the Catchment Area, and impact reflects the percentage difference. In terms of the pre-proposal trade pattern, we include two scenarios: the existing (2009) situation, and the expected (2012) situation, without the proposal.

Pre-Proposal Trade Distribution

9.4 The pre-proposal turnover of each store is calculated by applying the market share for each store to the available expenditure in that zone. The market shares for convenience shopping were derived from the Household Survey results (Tables 1c and 2c in Appendix 7) based on the main food, second main food and top-up shopping destinations, using the following weightings:

- Main food shopping 60%
- Other main food shopping 20%
- Top-up shopping 20%

9.5 We have estimated the proportion of each store's turnover which is derived from the Catchment Area in order to provide an estimate of the total turnover of each store. These judgements are based on the size and location of the stores and the shopping patterns set out in the Household Survey (Appendix 2).

9.6 This has been undertaken for two scenarios:

- Existing Situation (2009) (Table 1c)
- Design Year (2012) (Table 2c)

9.7 The latter includes estimated changes in market share to reflect the recent and expected changes in convenience provision.

Trading Pattern of Proposed Store

9.8 We next calculate the expected trading pattern and trade draw of the proposed convenience floorspace (Table 3c).

9.9 The benchmark turnover of the convenience floorspace has been calculated using an average sales density for Asda and Tesco. The total convenience turnover is estimated to be £38.8m in 2012 (Table 5a).

9.10 We have estimated the trading pattern of the proposed convenience floorspace by zone, taking into account the likely trading patterns of other large foodstores within and outside the Catchment Area. On this basis, we assume that 90% of the store's trade will be derived from within the Catchment Area. The resultant convenience turnover from the Catchment Area is £34.9m at 2012 (Table 5a).

9.11 The trade pattern and market penetration by zone in 2012 is set out in Table 3c and summarised below:

Zone	Trade draw	Turnover 2012	Market Share
Zone 1	30%	£11.6	26%
Zone 2	20%	£7.8	23%
Zone 3	9%	£3.5	14%
Zone 4	2%	£0.8	2%
Zone 5	2%	£0.8	8%
Zone 6	15%	£5.8	34%
Zone 7	10%	£3.9	22%
Zone 8	2%	£0.8	4%
Catchment Area	90%	£34.9	17%
Inflow	10%	£3.9	

Table 7 Trade Pattern by Zone at 2012

9.12 We consider that much of the trade will be derived from other large foodstores within and beyond the catchment area which are performing a similar role and function to the proposed foodstore. The Household Survey (Appendix 2) indicates that the majority of main food shopping trips are undertaken at the large foodstores within the catchment area, namely Morrisons and Tesco in

Barry, Tesco in Penarth and Tesco in Culverhouse Cross. These stores have a combined market share of approximately 53%. As such we would expect a large proportion of the trade to the proposed foodstore to be diverted from these main foodstores.

- 9.13 In addition, we would expect some trade to be diverted from other main food shopping destinations outside the Catchment Area (such as Asda and Morrisons in Cardiff Bay and Tesco Extra in Bridgend). The proportion of trade expected to be diverted from smaller stores within the catchment (such as the Iceland, Lidl and Waitrose stores in Barry) would be relatively low due to the fact that these stores and their respective 'offers' are different to the larger foodstores. However, given that the Lidl and Waitrose are both out of centre an impact on the market shares of these stores is considered acceptable.
- 9.14 We have adjusted the market shares of the stores from which the proposed store will draw trade, to derive the turnover of each store in 2012 post the proposal. This is set out in Tables 4c and 5c.

Convenience Impact of Proposed Store

- 9.15 To determine the impact of the convenience element of the proposed foodstore, we compare the pre-proposal turnover of each store in 2012 with the turnover following the development. This is set out in full in Table 6c and summarised in the table below. In absolute monetary terms, the biggest impacts will be on the Morrisons in Barry (-£10.9m) followed by the Tesco in Barry (-£7.4m), Tesco at Culverhouse Cross (-£2.9m), Asda at Cardiff Bay (-£1.9m) and Tesco in Penarth (-£1.9m).
- 9.16 In percentage terms, the biggest impacts will be on Morrisons in Barry (-24.5%), followed by Lidl in Barry (-23.3%), Tesco in Barry (-22.7%) and Iceland in Barry (-19.3%). The estimated impact on Barry town centre will be -£1.9 million which is predominantly expected to come from the existing Iceland foodstore and the new Tesco Express store. However, Iceland is currently overtrading by approximately £4million (Table 6c) and so will still be trading above its benchmark even with the proposed foodstore in operation.
- 9.17 Post proposal, only two existing foodstores are expected to have a lower turnover than their respective company benchmark turnover. These are the Tesco store at Culverhouse Cross and Waitrose in Palmerston Road. However this reflects the current assumed performance of both stores which is also below the respective company benchmarks, rather than the significant trade draw of the proposal (It is expected that the proposed foodstore will divert approximately £2.9m from Tesco and £1.6m from Waitrose).
- 9.18 However, both these stores are located out of centre and as such it is not appropriate to offer them any protection from competition. Therefore, the fact that they are potentially trading below benchmark is irrelevant for the purposes of this RA.

Store	Catchment area trade diverted to new store (£m)	Benchmark turnover (£m)	Store/centre turnover post proposal (£m)	Change in Turnover	
				From catchment (%)	Total (%)
Morrisons, Barry	-£10.9	£28.5	£33.4	-27.3%	-24.5%
Tesco, Barry	-£7.4	£21.3	£25.1	-25.2%	-22.7%
Iceland, Barry	-£1.2	£2.1	£4.8	-19.3%	-19.3%
Waitrose, Barry	-£1.6	£22.0	£10.5	-14.3%	-12.8%
Lidl, Barry	-£1.2	£2.8	£3.8	-25.8%	-23.3%
Other town centre Barry (inc Tesco Express)	-£0.8	n/a	£3.3	-19.0%	-19.0%
Other, out of centre Barry	-£0.8	n/a	£3.8	-17.0%	-17.0%
Tesco, Penarth	-£1.9	£23.4	£25.2	-7.9%	-7.1%
Tesco, Culverhouse Cross	-£2.9	£43.5	£37.3	-24.1%	-7.2%
Somerfield Llantwit Major	-£0.4	£2.4	£5.0	-7.1%	-7.1%
Other, Cowbridge	-£0.4	n/a	£3.8	-9.3%	-9.3%
Other Local Centres	£0.0	n/a	£0.8	0.0%	0.0%
Asda, Cardiff Bay	-£1.9	£40.5	£50.0	-18.7%	-3.7%
Aldi, Cardiff Bay	£0.0	£1.9	£5.3	0.0%	0.0%
Morrisons, Cardiff Bay	-£0.4	£5.1	£25.0	-7.6%	-1.5%
Tesco Extra, Bridgend	-£1.7	£42.2	£47.6	-23.6%	-3.5%
Tesco, Bridgend	-£0.4	£21.9	£40.8	-18.8%	-0.9%
Bridgend Other	-£0.4	n/a	£43.9	-17.5%	-0.9%
Other outflow	-£0.8	n/a	£51.5	-13.8%	-1.4%
Total	-£34.9			n/a	n/a

Table 8 Convenience Impact Summary Table

Comparison Trade Draw

9.19 The main steps in estimating comparison trade diversion are as follows:

- Calculate the pre-proposal turnover of the main centres and out-of-centre retail areas, which is derived by applying the comparison goods market shares from the Household Survey to the comparison expenditure for the Catchment Area.
- Estimate the expected trading pattern and trade draw of the proposed comparison retail floorspace.
- Calculate the expected turnover of existing centres and stores in 2012 following the proposed development, based on market share adjustments.

9.20 The expected trade diversion is the difference in the pre- and post-proposal turnover from the catchment area.

Pre-Proposal Comparison Turnover of Existing Centres

9.21 The pre-proposal (2012) turnover of each centre is calculated by applying the market share for each centre to the available expenditure in the Catchment Area. The comparison goods market shares for 2009 have been derived from the Household Survey and are set out in Table 3b. We have calculated the total comparison goods market shares by combining the market shares for individual categories of comparison goods using the weightings set out below; these are based on the national average proportion of expenditure by comparison goods category, derived from the Experian MMG3 Retail Planner data (2007).

- Clothing & Footwear 24%
- Kitchen & Household Goods 11%
- Small electrical appliances 11%
- Other recreational and miscellaneous items 54%

9.22 The turnover of the in-centre stores is subsumed within the total turnover of the relevant centre. We assume the market shares of all centres and retail areas remain unchanged between 2007 and 2012.

9.23 The pre-proposal turnover of existing centres and shopping destinations from the catchment area is set out in Table 3d.

Trading Pattern and Trade Draw of Proposed Store

9.24 The turnover of the proposed comparison floorspace was calculated for the comparison retail capacity analysis (Section 6 and Appendix 5). We expect the proposed comparison floorspace to have a turnover of £24.4m p.a. in 2012, of which £21.9m is expected to be derived from the catchment area. This is set out in Table 5b.

9.25 We have made judgements as to where the proposed scheme is expected to draw comparison trade from, taking into consideration a number of factors.

9.26 The first factor in determining comparison trade draw is main food shopping patterns, given that more than 50% of the proposed floorspace will be provided within a foodstore. The majority of comparison goods shopping within supermarkets is undertaken as secondary to convenience goods shopping. On this basis, the pattern of comparison trade diversion is likely to be broadly similar to the convenience diversion from the Catchment Area, and much of the comparison goods trade diverted to the store is likely to be derived from existing main foodstores with a comparison offer as people change their main food shopping destination. These stores include Asda and Morrisons in Cardiff Bay and Tesco Extra in Bridgend and Tesco at Culverhouse Cross.

9.27 The second factor is the existing comparison goods shopping patterns for the types of goods likely to be sold within the Barry Waterfront scheme (particularly clothing, electrical goods and household items). In this respect, we have had regard to the results of the Household Survey, together with the range and extent of comparison goods available in Barry, other centres and out-of-centre retailing.

9.28 A summary of the results of the survey is provided below:

Inside Catchment	Clothing & Footwear	Kitchen & Household Goods	Small Electrical	Recreational/ Misc Goods
Barry Town Centre	13.6%	14.6%	14.7%	18.2%
Barry out of centre	7.6%	9.6%	14.3%	6.0%
Penarth	3.0%	7.0%	8.2%	5.1%
Culverhouse Cross	11.8%	12.0%	22.0%	3.4%
Llantwit Major	0.3%	0.3%	0.2%	1.5%
Cowbridge	1.3%	1.4%	1.0%	2.8%
Cardiff	49.9%	41.6%	26.0%	50.8%
Bridgend	4.0%	5.0%	8.6%	5.0%
McArthur Glen, Bridgend	4.2%	2.5%	1.5%	2.2%
Talbot Green/Pontyclun	1.3%	1.6%	1.0%	1.9%
llantrisant	1.5%	2.5%	1.7%	1.2%
Swansea	0.1%	0.1%	0.0%	0.0%
Other outside area	1.4%	1.9%	1.0%	2.0%
Total	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%

Table 9 Summary of Comparison Market Shares

9.29

We would expect the proposed retail floorspace to draw comparison trade from the majority of the shopping destinations set out in the table above as well as the existing foodstores within and beyond the catchment area. As such, it is anticipated the trade draw of the proposed floorspace will be as follows:

Store/Centre	Proposed Foodstore		Proposed Comparison Units	
	Trade from Catchment Area (%) (1)	Trade from Catchment Area (£/m)	Trade from Catchment Area (%) (2)	Trade from Catchment Area (£/m)
	100%	£16.3	100%	£8.1
Morrisons, Barry	18%	£2.9	0%	£0.0
Tesco, Barry	23%	£3.7	5%	£0.4
Iceland, Barry	0%	£0.0	0%	£0.0
Waitrose, Barry	2%	£0.3	0%	£0.0
Lidl, Barry	2%	£0.3	0%	£0.0
Other, out of centre Barry	0%	£0.0	5%	£0.4
Tesco, Penarth	7%	£1.1	0%	£0.0
Tesco, Culverhouse Cross	10%	£1.6	5%	£0.4
Cowbridge Stores	0%	£0.0	0%	£0.0
Asda, Cardif Bay	4%	£0.7	5%	£0.4
Morrisons, Cardiff Bay	0%	£0.0	0%	£0.0
Tesco Extra, Bridgend	2%	£0.3	5%	£0.4
Bridgend Other	0%	£0.0	0%	£0.0
Barry Town Centre (excl. Iceland)	10%	£1.6	10%	£0.8
Penarth Town Centre	0%	£0.0	2%	£0.2
Culverhouse Cross	5%	£0.8	20%	£1.6
Cardiff (All)	7%	£1.1	25%	£2.0
Bridgend Town Centre	5%	£0.8	5%	£0.4
Bridgend, McArthur Glen	0%	£0.0	5%	£0.4
Other out of centre	5%	£0.8	8%	£0.6
Total	100%	£16.3	100%	£8.1

Table 10 Proposed Comparison Trade Draw Summary

9.30 We have adjusted the market shares of the nearby town centres and retail destinations based on the expected trade draw pattern of the proposed comparison floorspace.

9.31 The calculations involved in making these adjustments are set out in Table 5d in Appendix 8. The expected store turnover of £24.4 million has been apportioned between the centres and retail destinations according to the percentage trade draw pattern, and the expected trade diversion in monetary terms is deducted from the pre-proposal turnover of the individual stores and centres, to give the post-proposal turnover. The adjusted market shares are then calculated based on the post-proposal turnover distribution within the catchment area.

Comparison Impact of Proposed Floorspace

9.32 The comparison impact of the proposed comparison floorspace on the existing centres and other retail destinations is set out in Table 5d in Appendix 8 and summarised below.

Centre	Proposed Trade Draw from Catchment		Turnover from Catchment Area		Total Impact	
	%	£m	Pre Proposal (£m)	Post Proposal (£m)	£m	%
		24.4		24.4		
Barry Town Centre	10%	£2.4	£54.2	£51.7	-£2.4	-4%
Barry out of centre	33%	£8.1	£24.1	£16.0	-£8.1	-34%
Penarth	5%	£1.3	£17.5	£16.2	-£1.3	-7%
Culverhouse Cross	18%	£4.5	£29.6	£25.1	-£4.5	-15%
Llantwit Major	0%	£0.0	£4.2	£4.2	£0.0	0%
Cowbridge	0%	£0.0	£8.3	£8.3	£0.0	0%
Cardiff	17%	£4.2	£163.4	£159.2	-£4.2	-3%
Bridgend	8%	£1.9	£22.2	£20.2	-£1.9	-9%
McArthur Glen, Bridgend	2%	£0.4	£9.7	£9.3	-£0.4	-4%
Talbot Green/Pontyclun	0%	£0.0	£7.1	£7.1	£0.0	0%
Llantrisant	0%	£0.0	£6.6	£6.6	£0.0	0%
Swansea	0%	£0.0	£0.0	£0.0	£0.0	0%
Other Outside Catchment Area	6%	£1.5	£6.9	£5.4	-£1.5	-21%
Total	100%	£24.4	£353.7	£329.4	-£24.4	-7%

Table 11 Comparison Floorspace Impact Summary

9.33 The biggest total impact in monetary terms is on Barry out of centre stores which will experience a trade diversion of £8.1 million. Whilst this appears a significant impact, the overall impact will be relatively dilute with the majority of trade diverted from existing out of centre foodstores such as Morrisons, Tesco and Lidl as well as the existing units at Barry Waterfront Retail Park. Consequently, no one store will experience an unacceptable adverse impact.

9.34 Culverhouse Cross will experience the next biggest trade diversion of £4.5 million which will largely be diverted from the existing Tesco store, Marks & Spencer and other retailers such as Comet and Mothercare which are located within the retail park,

- 9.35 Barry Town Centre will experience a trade diversion of approximately £2.4 million which will largely come from the existing stores along Holton Road. However, this equates to only a 4% impact. Furthermore, given the number of shops and the variety of goods sold, no one store will be expected to be adversely impacted upon by the proposed development.

Impact Conclusions

- 9.36 In conclusion, it is considered that the biggest impacts will be on the existing large foodstores within and beyond the catchment area such as Morrisons in Barry, Tesco in Barry, Tesco at Culverhouse Cross and Asda at Cardiff Bay. The majority of these foodstores are out of centre and as such should not be accorded any protection against competition. Therefore, the proposed impacts on these stores are acceptable.
- 9.37 In terms of impacts on existing centres and other retail destinations Culverhouse Cross and Barry town centre will experience the largest diversions of trade. Again, as Culverhouse Cross is an out of centre Retail Park it is considered that any impact upon this development is considered acceptable.
- 9.38 With regards to Barry town centre it is expected that £1.9 million will be drawn from the existing Iceland foodstore and the new Tesco Express. This is considered acceptable as the existing Iceland store is overtrading above benchmark by over £4 million and the impact on Tesco Express will be negligible. As such, a diversion of £1.9 million will not impact on the store's ability to continue to trade successfully.
- 9.39 In terms of comparison trade draw, it is anticipated that the proposed floorspace will equate to a £2.4 million trade draw from Barry town centre. This is equivalent to a 4% impact on Barry town centre, which will not detrimentally affect its vitality and viability and thus is considered acceptable.
- 9.40 Within the catchment area, the only other town centre which the proposal is expected to draw comparison trade from is Penarth which is expected to see a diversion of approximately £1.3 million. However, this will be relatively dilute throughout the centre with no one store significantly impacted.
- 9.41 Overall, it is not considered that the proposals will have a detrimental impact on the baseline health of any of the existing centres in terms of their vitality or viability.