



Penderfyniad ar yr Apêl

Ymweliad â safle a wnaed ar 02/09/20

gan H C Davies, BA (Hons) Dip UP
MRTPI

Arolygydd a benodir gan Weinidogion Cymru

Dyddiad: 13th October 2020

Appeal Decision

Site visit made on 02/09/20

by H C Davies, BA (Hons) Dip UP MRTPI

an Inspector appointed by the Welsh Ministers

Date: 13th October 2020

Appeal Ref: APP/Z6950/A/20/3253163

Site address: Pen y Garth Mansion, 2 Stanwell Road, Penarth CF64 3EA

The Welsh Ministers have transferred the authority to decide this appeal to me as the appointed Inspector.

- The appeal is made under section 78 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 against a refusal to grant planning permission.
 - The appeal is made by Mr Ahmed of Silver Crescent Developments Ltd against the decision of The Vale of Glamorgan Council.
 - The application Ref: 2020/00064/FUL dated 22 January 2020, was refused by notice dated 19 March 2020.
 - The development proposed is erection of enclosure above existing car parking spaces.
-

Decision

1. The appeal is dismissed.

Main Issue

2. This is the effect of the development on the character and appearance of the area having regard to its location in the Penarth Conservation Area (CA).

Reasons

3. The appeal site forms part of the communal forecourt parking area at the front of Pen y Garth Mansion. This residential property is located in the town centre, which consists of a variety of retail, commercial and residential uses. The parking area lies immediately adjacent to a busy road junction and has a frontage onto both Rectory Road and Stanwell Road, the latter a principal trafficked route through the town. As such it occupies a highly prominent space within the town centre and the CA. Whilst the proposal would draw some parallels from the commercial character of the town centre, given the close functional and visual relationship to the existing residential building, it would be seen primarily in this context.
 4. The main building is not listed but is recognised as making a positive contribution to the special architectural or historic interest of the CA in the Penarth Conservation Area Appraisal and Management Plan Supplementary Planning Guidance 2011 (CAAM SPG). Directly opposite is the Grade II listed public library and immediately adjacent is an area listed on the CADW Parks and Gardens Register as important for the setting of the Historic Alexandra Park. Hence the site occupies a sensitive location within the CA.
-

5. The development would be a lightweight contemporary structure that would occupy an open part of the forecourt. It would not be unacceptably large in scale but given the use of steel for the frame along with aluminium glazing bars and translucent polycarbonate sheets for the roof, it would have an overtly utilitarian appearance at odds with its immediate residential setting. It would relate poorly to the predominantly red brick and slate exteriors of Pen y Garth Mansion and the traditional character of this part of Stanwell Road which consists of Victorian houses constructed in local limestone, red and yellow brick. It would also appear at odds with the pennant sandstone exterior of the public library directly opposite. Furthermore, the canopy would be sited up against mature trees, including a TPO, which contribute to the setting of Pen y Garth Mansion and the CA. The siting and appearance of the canopy would diminish the amenity value of the trees exacerbating the adverse effects that I have identified.
6. The appeal site does not have an entirely undeveloped appearance, given that it is a hard-surfaced area with parked cars and ancillary structures visible from the public highway. It would also benefit from some screening when approaching from the south along Stanwell Road. Nevertheless, along Rectory Road the front boundary consists of a low wall with railings. The structure would therefore be readily perceptible in views from this road and when approaching from the north along Stanwell Road, which is an important thoroughfare within this part of the CA. Given the proximity of the canopy to the footpath, the proposed structure would be prominent in the street scene and appear as a discordant feature that would draw the eye. Hence it would cause visual harm to the immediate area with consequent adverse effects on the wider CA.
7. I conclude that the proposal would be harmful to the character and appearance of the area contrary to Policies MD2 and MD5 of the Vale of Glamorgan Local Development Plan (LDP) which require development to be of a high standard of design and of an appropriate scale, form and layout that is sympathetic to and contributes positively to the character and appearance of its surroundings. The proposal would also fail to preserve or enhance the character or appearance of the Penarth Conservation Area, contrary to LDP Policies SP10 and MD8 and the CAMM SPG.

Other Matter

8. I note that the purpose of the canopy is to protect parked cars from falling sap and debris from adjacent trees. Whilst it might be the case that the canopy would make the parking area more useable, the harm arising from its design and siting would be significant. I am required to pay special attention to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of the CA and in this case the highway and parking benefits put forward in support of the scheme would not be sufficient to outweigh these considerations.

Conclusions

9. In reaching my decision, I have taken into account the requirements of sections 3 and 5 of the Well-Being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015. I consider that this decision is in accordance with the Act's sustainable development principle through its contribution towards the Welsh Ministers' well-being objective of supporting safe, cohesive and resilient communities.
10. For the reasons given above, the appeal is dismissed.

H C Davies

INSPECTOR